August 17, 2017

The Honorable Mark E. Hood
Presiding Judge of the Superior Court
County of Monterey
240 Church Street
Salinas, CA 93901

RE: Response to the 2016-17 Monterey County Civil Grand Jury Final Report - “The Impact of Second Language Learners from Low Income Families on Elementary School Education in Salinas”

Honorable Judge Hood:

The 2016-17 Civil Grand Jury Final Report - “The Impact of Second Language Learners from Low Income Families on Elementary School Education in Salinas” - focuses on the need for English Learners to attain proficiency which is a top priority for Monterey County.

Findings and Recommendations

F2. The three elementary school districts in Salinas are not meeting statewide averages for English and math test scores.

The Santa Rita Union School District Superintendent and the Santa Rita Union School District Board agree with this finding.

F3. The K-3 class sizes exceed the 20 students per teacher that was mandated by the California Department of Education in 1996.

The Santa Rita Union School District Superintendent and the Santa Rita Union School District Board partially agree with this finding.

The K-3 Class Size Reduction (CSR) Program (Senate Bill 1777, Chapter 163, Statutes of 1996) was established in 1996 for kindergarten through third grade. This program provided funds to school districts and charter schools that reduced class size to 20 pupils or fewer per certificated teacher. The program ended at the conclusion of the 2012-13 school year.

Serving the students of Santa Rita —
Currently California Education Code (EC) sections 41376 and 41378 prescribe the maximum class sizes and penalties for districts with any classes that exceed the following limits:

- Kindergarten – average class size not to exceed 31 students; no class larger than 33 students
- Grades one through three – average class size not to exceed 30 students; no class larger than 32 students
- Grades four through eight – in the current fiscal year, average number of students per teacher not to exceed the greater of 29.9 or the district’s average number of students per teacher from the base year of 1964

Finally, with the implementation of Local Control Funding Formula (LCFF), the California Department of Education, Title 5, Chapter 14.6 addresses the addition of Grade Span Adjustment that allows for additional funding for grades TK through Third.

Grade Span Adjustment is included in our district LCAP. We strive to maintain Grade Span Adjustment (GSA) for grades TK-3 (24:1) and reduced class size grades 4 - 8 with a goal of 26:1. (See Appendix 1)

The Santa Rita Union School District continues to provide a district-wide quality base program (built upon student access to state board adopted content and performance standards) through Grade Span Adjustment grades TK-3 (24:1). We also maintain an average class size of 26:1 for grades 4 through 8 to support teachers in developing classroom based tiered intervention based on student need.

**F4. The general goals for the progress of ELL students set by the California Department of Education for teaching ELL students are not specific or quantifiable, and do not provide a standard against which actual results could be compared.**

The Santa Rita Union School District Superintendent and the Santa Rita Union School District partially agree with this finding.

We agree the California Department of Education (CDE) goals for the progress of English Learner students are not specific or quantifiable. Research indicates it takes between five to seven years for a child to acquire the academic language that is needed to be on a level with native speakers. (Hakuta, K., Goto Butler, Y. & Witt, D. (2000), **How Long Does It Take English Learners to Attain Proficiency?**, Stanford, CA: The University of California Linguistic Minority Research Institute). English Learners enter school at different stages of English language development and with varied linguistic and experiential backgrounds. A student’s background knowledge and level of proficiency in their primary language affects the pace at which a student will attain English proficiency.

The California Department of Education’s **English Language Arts, English Language Development Framework** provides a standard for the progress of all English Learners that specifically defines the stages of progress of English language development. English Learners take the California English Language Development Test (CELDT) annually in order to measure their progress. This test assesses four language domains: reading, writing, listening, and speaking. In addition, the CELDT measures five levels of proficiency: beginning, early intermediate, early advanced, and advanced. The CELDT Performance Descriptors define the specific English proficiencies at each level. (Appendix 2). The CDE expects that, “English learners acquire full proficiency in English as rapidly and effectively as possible and attain parity with native speakers of English,” and, “within a
reasonable period, achieve the same rigorous grade level academic standards that are expected of all students.”

The test components of CELDT domains are listed in the chart below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Domain</th>
<th>Test Component K-1</th>
<th>Test Component Grades 2-12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Listening</td>
<td>■ Following Oral Directions</td>
<td>■ Following Oral Directions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Teacher Talk</td>
<td>■ Teacher Talk</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Extended Listening Comprehension</td>
<td>■ Extended Listening Comprehension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Rhyming</td>
<td>■ Rhyming (Grade 2 only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speaking</td>
<td>■ Oral Vocabulary</td>
<td>■ Oral Vocabulary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Speech Functions</td>
<td>■ Speech Functions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Choose and Give Reasons</td>
<td>■ Choose and Give Reasons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ 4-Picture Narrative</td>
<td>■ 4-Picture Narrative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>■ Word Analysis</td>
<td>■ Word Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Fluency and Vocabulary</td>
<td>■ Fluency and Vocabulary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Reading Comprehension</td>
<td>■ Reading Comprehension</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Writing</td>
<td>■ Copying Letters and Words</td>
<td>■ Grammar and Structure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Writing Words</td>
<td>■ Writing Sentences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>■ Punctuation and Capitalization</td>
<td>■ Writing Short Composition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Additionally, each district’s Local Control and Accountability Plan must include baseline data and defined goals for English Learner progress toward English proficiency as measured by CELDT progress and Reclassification data.

Further, the CDE’s new Local Control Funding Formula (LCFF) has an evaluation rubric that includes the expectation that English learners will move up at least one CELDT level until they are reclassified (see Appendix 3).

F5. It is unlikely that the low amount of funding per student ADA, the disparity between the cost of living in Salinas, and starting teachers’ salaries will be solved in the foreseeable future.

The Santa Rita Union School District Superintendent and the Santa Rita Union School District Board agree with this finding. The amount of state funds per student ADA is the same regardless of where your district is located (except for basic aid districts). Therefore, in a high cost area, the funding is the same as in a low cost area.
F6. The new CSUMB/Hartnell College joint venture, the “Professional Teacher Pathway,” in South Monterey County provides a blueprint for similar programs and would contribute to a long-term solution to the shortage of qualified teachers in the Salinas elementary schools.

The Santa Rita Union School District Superintendent and the Santa Rita Union School District Board agree with this finding. The new CSUMB/Hartnell College joint venture to create a professional teacher pathway could indeed help the greater Salinas area grow local talent and produce teachers who are from the community and want to teach in or near their hometowns in the future.

F7. Cooperation and coordination between the elementary school districts and the Salinas middle schools within the Salinas Union High School District is not adequate to ensure that all students entering middle schools are equally prepared.

The Santa Rita Union School District Superintendent and the Santa Rita Union School District Board partially agree with this finding.

Santa Rita Union School District feeds its students to the Salinas Union High School District in the ninth grade. Coordination among the district’s’ academic programs is important. While our district is responsible for its own curriculum that is approved by our local school board, articulation from our district to the high school district ensures continuity in the students’ educational preparation.

Currently, our district has been working collaboratively to articulate our programs and have plans to deepen the coordination of our programs to ensure that all students entering high schools are equally prepared.

R1. The Salinas elementary school districts should adopt specific goals for the number of years it should take for ELL students to achieve proficiency.

The Santa Rita Union School District has adopted specific goals for English Learners to access academic English in the English Learner Master Plan, as evidenced on page 8 of the plan (see appendix 4). Additionally, the Santa Rita Union School District has adopted specific goals of focus in the Local Control Accountability Plan (LCAP) that include English Learners and students not at grade level in language arts and/or mathematics. These goals are evident throughout our LCAP, with specific Actions noted in Goal 2: actions 1, 4, and 5 (see SRUSD website).

R2. The three Salinas school districts should establish and use a uniform ELL curriculum to ensure that all students are equally prepared when entering middle school.

Each district has the flexibility to choose from a State Board Adopted List of materials that best meets the needs of the students in the district. While each district may not choose the same publisher, each district must work toward students mastering the same standards. In the case of the Santa Rita Union School District, it was important to adopt English Learner materials that aligned with the English Language Arts adoption (currently Houghton Mifflin - TK - 8), so students were not only instructed in how to speak, listen, read and write in English, but also had the scaffolding necessary to access the English Language Arts curriculum in their core classes.
Because the Santa Rita Union School District keeps our students through eighth grade, it is our core belief students should be reclassified prior to transitioning to high school. All students should be able to access the high school level curriculum.

We thank you for the opportunity to review and comment on the findings and recommendations of the 2016-2017 Monterey County Civil Grand Jury Final Report — “The Impact of Second Language Learners from Low Income Families on Elementary School Education in Salinas.”

Sincerely,

Shelly D. Morr
Superintendent

Elva Arellano
Board President
Appendix 1

Title 5. EDUCATION

Division 1. California Department of Education

Chapter 14.6. Local Control Funding

Formula Kindergarten and Grades One Through Three Grade Span Adjustment

Article 1. Apportionments and Allowances

§ 15498. Purpose.

The Superintendent of Public Instruction (SSPI) deems this chapter necessary for the effective administration of the kindergarten and grades one through three grade span adjustment as specified in Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3), and for the determinations thereby required of the SSPI in computing apportionments and allowances from the State School Fund.


§ 15498.1. Definitions.

For the purposes of administering the provisions of this chapter and the provisions of Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3), the following definitions apply:

(a) "Class" means a group of pupils scheduled to report regularly at a particular time to a particular teacher during the regular school day as defined by the school district governing board, excluding special day classes. Classes in the evening and summer schools are not classes for purposes of this section.

(b) Where the type of teaching in kindergarten and grades 1, 2, and 3 is other than in self-contained classes, the "class" is the basic homeroom where all of the following applies for a pupil:

1. Attendance is recorded and investigation of absences is instigated.
2. The pupil has his or her desk, locker, or drawer.
3. The teacher handles the administrative routines such as keeping cumulative records, collecting basic data about the pupil, distributing items to go home, collecting meal money, and distributing and collecting report cards.
4. The teacher is the usual contact with the pupil's parents.
5. Some planned instruction is given.

(c) "Kindergarten" includes transitional kindergarten as defined by Education Code section 48000.

(d) "Active enrollment count" for purposes of subdivision (e) means the count of pupils enrolled in the class on the first day of the school year on which the class was in session, plus all later enrollees, minus all withdrawals since that first day. A pupil who is enrolled in independent study pursuant to Article 5.5 of Chapter 5 of Part 28 of the Education Code for the full regular school day shall not be included. An active enrollment count shall be made on the last teaching day of each school month that ends prior to April 15 of the school year.

(e) The "average number of pupils enrolled per class" for kindergarten and grades 1, 2, and 3 is the number obtained by dividing the sum of the active enrollment counts made under subdivision (d) for each of the classes in those grades, by the total number of those active enrollment counts.

(f) "Average class enrollment" means the sum of the average number of pupils enrolled per class determined pursuant to subdivision (e) for all kindergarten and grades 1, 2, and 3 classes at a school site, divided by the number of classes, then rounded to the nearest half or whole integer.

(g) "Maximum average class enrollment" for purposes of section 15498.3 means the amount determined by subtracting the current year average class enrollment adjustment pursuant to Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3)(B)(v) from the prior year average class enrollment pursuant to Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3)(B)(i), then rounded to the nearest half or whole integer. Commencing with the 2014-15 school year, the prior year average class enrollment for purposes of Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3)(B)(i) is the maximum average class enrollment in the prior year.
§ 15498.2. Combined Grades.

For the purposes of this chapter, any class combining pupils in any grade other than kindergarten or grades 1, 2, or 3 with pupils in kindergarten or grades 1, 2, or 3, shall be considered a class of kindergarten and grades 1, 2, and 3. All of the pupils in said classes shall be included in an active enrollment count.


§ 15498.3. Class Size Requirements of the Local Control Funding Formula.

For purposes of determining if a school district meets the conditions for receiving the kindergarten and grades one through three grade span adjustment, pursuant to Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3)(B), the following shall apply:

(a) Every school district that elects to receive the kindergarten and grades one through three grade span adjustment shall calculate the maximum average class enrollment for each school site.

(b) A district's average class enrollment at each school site shall not exceed the maximum average class enrollment for each school site, unless the school district has agreed to a collectively bargained alternative annual average class enrollment for each school site pursuant to Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3)(B) for the applicable year.

(c) The prior year average class enrollment for a school site that did not exist in the prior year shall be the median prior year average class enrollment in kindergarten and grades 1, 2, and 3 of the other school sites in the district.

(d) In the case of a school district that reorganizes subsequent to fiscal year 2012-13, the provisions of Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3)(C) shall not apply unless all school sites in the reorganized school districts were at or below an average class enrollment of 24 in kindergarten and grades 1, 2, and 3.

(e) A school district may determine the percentage of need met as specified in Education Code section 42238.02(d)(3)(B)(iii) utilizing the estimated percentage of statewide funded need for the applicable year as calculated by the Department of Finance (DOF) based on its estimate of statewide need and the amount that it proposes to appropriate to the SSPI for allocation pursuant to Education Code section 42238.03(b) and stated in DOF's May revision to the Governor's Budget.

Appendix 2

Overall Test Performance Descriptors

Kindergarten and Grade One

Advanced
Students at this level of English language performance communicate effectively with various audiences on a wide range of familiar and new topics to meet social and learning demands. In order to attain the English proficiency level of their native English-speaking peers, further linguistic enhancement and refinement are still necessary. They are able to orally identify and summarize concrete details and abstract concepts during unmodified instruction in all academic domains. Written production reflects grade-appropriate discourse. Errors are infrequent and do not reduce communication.

Early Advanced
Students at this level of English language performance begin to combine the elements of the English language in complex, cognitively demanding situations and are able to use English as a means for learning in academic domains. They are able to identify and summarize most concrete details and abstract concepts during unmodified instruction in most academic domains. Oral production is characterized by more elaborate discourse, and written production includes simple sentences often using two-syllable words. Errors are less frequent and rarely complicate communication.

Intermediate
Students at this level of English language performance begin to tailor the English language skills to meet communication and learning demands with increasing accuracy. They are able to identify and understand more concrete details and some abstract concepts during unmodified instruction. They are able to respond and express themselves orally with increasing ease to more varied communication and learning demands with a reduced number of errors. Written production has usually expanded to common phrases and one-syllable words. Errors still complicate communication.

Early Intermediate
Students at this level of English language performance continue to develop receptive and productive English skills. They are able to identify and understand more concrete details during unmodified instruction. They may be able to respond with increasing ease to more varied communication and learning demands with a reduced number of errors. Oral production is usually limited to phrases and memorized statements and questions. Written production is limited to letters and high-frequency, one-syllable words. Frequent errors still reduce communication.

Beginning
Students at this level of English language performance may demonstrate little or no receptive or productive English skills. They are beginning to understand a few concrete details during unmodified instruction. They may be able to respond to some communication and learning demands, but with many errors. Oral production is usually limited to disconnected words and memorized statements and questions. Written production is incomprehensible or limited to common letters. Frequent errors make communication difficult.
Grades Two Through Twelve

Advanced
Students at this level of English language performance communicate effectively with various audiences on a wide range of familiar and new topics to meet social and learning demands. In order to attain the English proficiency level of their native English-speaking peers, further linguistic enhancement and refinement are still necessary. They are able to identify and summarize concrete details and abstract concepts during unmodified instruction in all academic domains. Oral and written productions reflect discourse appropriate for academic domains. Errors are infrequent and do not reduce communication.

Early Advanced
Students at this level of English language performance begin to combine the elements of the English language in complex, cognitively demanding situations and are able to use English as a means for learning in academic domains. They are able to identify and summarize most concrete details and abstract concepts during unmodified instruction in most academic domains. Oral and written productions are characterized by more elaborate discourse and fully developed paragraphs and compositions. Errors are less frequent and rarely complicate communication.

Intermediate
Students at this level of English language performance begin to tailor the English language skills to meet communication and learning demands with increasing accuracy. They are able to identify and understand more concrete details and some major abstract concepts during unmodified instruction. They are able to respond with increasing ease to more varied communication and learning demands with a reduced number of errors. Oral and written productions have usually expanded to sentences, paragraphs, and original statements and questions. Errors still complicate communication.

Early Intermediate
Students at this level of English language performance continue to develop receptive and productive English skills. They are able to identify and understand more concrete details during unmodified instruction. They may be able to respond with increasing ease to more varied communication and learning demands with a reduced number of errors. Oral and written productions are usually limited to phrases and memorized statements and questions. Frequent errors still reduce communication.

Beginning
Students at this level of English language performance may demonstrate little or no receptive or productive English skills. They are beginning to understand a few concrete details during unmodified instruction. They may be able to respond to some communication and learning demands, but with many errors. Oral and written production is usually limited to disconnected words and memorized statements and questions. Frequent errors make communication difficult.
# California School Dashboard and LCFF Evaluation Rubrics Indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State Indicator</th>
<th>Status</th>
<th>Change</th>
<th>Applies to</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Graduation Rate</td>
<td>Four-year cohort graduation rate</td>
<td>Status compared with average four-year cohort graduation rate for three years prior to the status year</td>
<td>Districts, charters, and schools for grades 9-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suspension Rate</td>
<td>Number of pupils suspended at least once in school year divided by number of enrolled students</td>
<td>Status compared with pupils suspended at least once in school year divided by number of enrolled students in year prior to the status year</td>
<td>Districts, charters, and schools for grades TK-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English Learner Progress</td>
<td>Percent of English learners (ELs) who moved up at least one CELDT (soon to be ELPAC) level or were reclassified</td>
<td>Status compared with percent of ELs who moved up at least one CELDT level or who were reclassified each of the past three years or in the year prior to the status year</td>
<td>Districts, charters, and schools for grades TK-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic: English Language Arts</td>
<td>Proficiency rate on English Language Arts Smarter Balanced Assessment for grades 3-8</td>
<td>Status compared with proficiency rate on English Language Arts Smarter Balanced Assessment for grades 3-8 in year prior to the status year</td>
<td>Districts, charters, and schools for grades TK-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic: Mathematics</td>
<td>Proficiency rate on Mathematics Smarter Balanced Assessment for grades 3-8</td>
<td>Status compared with proficiency rate on Mathematics Smarter Balanced Assessment for grades 3-8 in year prior to the status year</td>
<td>Districts, charters, and schools for grades TK-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chronic Absenteeism</td>
<td>There will be no performance provided for this state performance indicator in 2017.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Districts, charters, and schools for grades TK-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College and Career Readiness</td>
<td>This will be a local indicator for 2016-17, but will transition to a state indicator in 2017-18. It is expected to include “a-g” course completion, AP pass rate, and CAASPP test results for grade 11.</td>
<td></td>
<td>Districts, charters, and schools for grades TK-12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Santa Rita Union School District
### Placement in Instructional Programs
(CCR: EL 3a, EL 3b)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program Name and Admission Criteria by CELDT Level</th>
<th>English Language Development Class (English Immersion)</th>
<th>English Language Mainstream Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Description</strong></td>
<td>Students learn the English language and modified core curriculum.</td>
<td>Students learn grade-level core curriculum and continue their English learning.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Goals**                                          | 1. Rapid development of English listening, speaking, reading and writing skills.  
2. Subject matter/core instruction at language ability level.  
Note: This is a literacy program that is driven by the English Language Development (ELD) Standards using the District-adopted ELD text(s) and language arts text(s) materials. | 1. Continued English Language Development (ELD); listening, speaking, reading, writing  
2. Meet grade-level content standards through modified instruction (SDAIE, materials, etc.)  
3. Meet district R-FEP criteria |
| **Students Served**                                | English learners with less than “reasonable” English fluency:  
- Beginning  
- Early Intermediate  
- Low Intermediate | English learners with “reasonable” English fluency:  
- High Intermediate  
- Early Advanced  
- Advanced |
| **Program Duration**                               | One or two years, depending on need | Students should exit this program after a maximum of three years. |
| **ELD Instruction**                                | Combined with Language Arts:  
ELD  
Listening  
Speaking  
Reading  
Writing | Combined with Language Arts:  
ELD  
Listening  
Speaking  
Reading  
Writing |
| **Core Content**                                   | 1. Subject matter at language ability level  
2. Sheltered strategies | 1. Transition to grade level subject matter  
2. SDAIE strategies |
| **Special Features**                               | This program is legally considered to be an “English Immersion Classroom” and is required by state law. (Prop. 227) | This program is legally considered to be an “English Language Mainstream Classroom.” |
| **Teacher Authorization**                          | CLAD, BCLAD, LDS, BCC, SB 1969/395, or in training. | CLAD, BCLAD, LDS, BCC, SB 1969/395, or in training. |
| **Mainstream Program**                             | Students learn grade-level core curriculum taught in English. | 1. Meet grade-level content standards. |

**Notes:**

- **N/A** indicates information not applicable or not specified.
- **Combined with Language Arts:** ELD  
Listening  
Speaking  
Reading  
Writing
- **SDAIE strategies:** This program is legally considered to be an “English Language Mainstream Classroom.”

---

*Page 11*