Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice: Public Participation Summary

September 2018

MIG, Inc.
800 Hearst Avenue, Berkeley, CA 94710

In association with:
Veronica Tam & Associates
107 S. Fair Oaks Avenue #212, Pasadena, CA 91105
Executive Summary

In Monterey County, four entitlement jurisdictions and a countywide housing agency are collaborating on the preparation of a Regional Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice (AI). This group of city, county and agency partners, referred to in this document as the “Collaborating Parties,” includes:

- City of Monterey
- City of Salinas
- City of Seaside
- County of Monterey (Urban County)
- Housing Authority for the County of Monterey

In partnership with MIG, Inc. and Veronica Tam and Associates, the Collaborating Parties conducted a comprehensive outreach process throughout Monterey County to identify barriers to fair housing choice, as well as strategies to address those challenges. Over 500 community members and service providers provided input through the online questionnaire, partner forums and community workshops. The key findings from the public outreach and engagement process are summarized below.

Housing Barriers

- The **inadequate supply of affordable housing** in Monterey County particularly impacts low-income households and households of color.
- **Homelessness, overcrowding, and substandard housing** are increasingly prevalent as many households are unable to afford the cost of rent.
- The increased **costs of living** in Monterey County exacerbate the housing affordability crisis.
- Many **full-time jobs** do not pay sufficiently to afford housing in Monterey County. **Job centers** are also located far away from affordable housing units.
- Insufficient and unreliable **public transportation** at the local and regional levels creates an additional barrier to accessing affordable housing.

Challenges to Affordable Housing Development

- The lack of affordable housing is **intensified by the region’s water shortage**, which limits new development of affordable housing.
- Some communities resist **changes to development standards** that would allow the construction of multi-family rental housing and other affordable housing typologies.
- Low-income households may be at **risk of displacement** in areas subject to strong development pressure or activity.
- **Increased regional coordination** can assist in effectively addressing housing supply and affordability issues.
Fair Housing Rights and Protected Classes

- **Frequent targets of discrimination** include people of color, families with children, the elderly, people with disabilities, Section 8 recipients, farmworkers, undocumented immigrants and Spanish-speakers.
- Communities struggling with housing discrimination issues often **lack awareness of fair housing rights**.
- Individuals who experience housing discrimination rarely report incidents due to **fear of retaliation** and/or a lack of faith in the reporting processes.

The input and findings from the public participation activities will be incorporated into the development of the AI. The draft AI will be available for public review in Spring 2019.
Table of Contents

Executive Summary ........................................................................................................................................... i

I. Introduction .................................................................................................................................................. 1
   A. Public Outreach Overview .................................................................................................................. 3

II. Key Audiences and Outreach Tools ......................................................................................................... 4
   A. Target Audiences .............................................................................................................................. 4
   B. Outreach Tools ................................................................................................................................. 5

III. Public Input Opportunities and Activities ............................................................................................. 9
   A. Online Survey ..................................................................................................................................... 9
   B. Stakeholder Interviews .................................................................................................................... 9
   C. Partner Forums ............................................................................................................................... 10
   D. Community Workshops .................................................................................................................. 10

IV. Key Findings by Outreach Activity ....................................................................................................... 13
   A. Partner Forum Findings .................................................................................................................... 13
   B. Community Workshop Findings ...................................................................................................... 16

V. Next Steps ................................................................................................................................................. 22

List of Appendices

Appendix A: Contacted Stakeholders and Service Providers Across Monterey County
Appendix B: Participating Agencies, Groups and Organizations
Appendix C: Online Survey Results
Appendix D: Summary of Stakeholder Interviews
Appendix E: Partner Forum Discussion Questions
Appendix F: Community Workshop Discussion Questions
Appendix G: Salinas Workshop Flyer and Questionnaires
I. Introduction

In accordance with U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) regulations, community recipients of Federal community development block grant funds must certify that they are affirmatively furthering fairness and equal opportunity in housing for individuals and groups protected by the federal Fair Housing Act of 1968. To meet this obligation, jurisdictions that administer or directly receive federal funds from HUD are required to perform an Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice (AI) as part of their consolidated planning process for housing and community development programs.

In Monterey County, four entitlement jurisdictions and a countywide housing agency are collaborating on the preparation of a Regional Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice (AI). This group of city, county and agency partners, referred to in this document as the “Collaborating Parties” includes:

- City of Monterey
- City of Salinas
- City of Seaside
- County of Monterey (Urban County)
- Housing Authority for the County of Monterey (HACM)

As an entitlement jurisdiction for HUD funding purposes, the Monterey Urban County includes the unincorporated areas of Monterey County as well as the cities of Gonzales, Greenfield and Sand City. The City of Del Rey Oaks will join the Urban County on July 1, 2019.

The Collaborating Parties are working together to develop the Regional AI to identify barriers to fair housing choice across the county, and to collectively identify strategies to address those challenges. Figure 1 highlights the steps to developing an AI on the next page.

The Collaborating Parties began the AI process by initiating an Assessment of Fair Housing (AFH) until HUD determined that the AI process would take precedence. This AI process therefore includes the core goals and principles associated with the AFH, such as a focus on actionable steps for Salinas Partner Forum, May 17th, 2018.
removing barriers to fair housing. This AI process empowers local communities to determine actionable steps for eliminating barriers to fair housing throughout Monterey County.

**Figure 1: Analysis of Impediments Process Graphic**

The scope of the Regional AI is broad. Specific areas of research include:

- Demographic and housing characteristics
- Patterns of segregation and integration
- Racially or ethnically concentrated areas of poverty (R/ECAPs)
- Disparities in access to housing opportunity
- Disproportionate housing needs
- Publicly supported housing
- Disability and access
- Fair housing enforcement, outreach capacity, and resources
- Fair housing goals and priorities

The AI recommendations to address fair housing needs serve as the basis for fair housing planning throughout Monterey County, focusing on the geographic areas governed by the Collaborating Parties, and provide critical information to staff, policy makers, housing providers, lenders, fair housing advocates, and the general public.
A. Public Outreach Overview

Outreach is an essential component of developing the AI. Engaging local communities and stakeholders is an effective approach to assessing the nature and extent of impediments to fair housing. Community members affected by restrictions to fair housing choice have the right to share their concerns and participate in the decision-making process to mitigate and/or eliminate barriers to fair housing. According to the Fair Housing Planning Guide (Volume 1),

“HUD works to foster effective fair housing strategies, [and] it recognizes that, as in most things, the people most knowledgeable about fair housing problems facing their communities are the people who live in those communities.”

The Collaborating Parties, in partnership with MIG, Inc. and Veronica Tam and Associates, facilitated a comprehensive outreach process throughout Monterey County to ensure a broad cross-section of residents, housing providers and professionals, interest groups, government agencies and community organizations participated in the AI development.

Between February and June 2018, MIG conducted two partner forums, four community workshops and eight stakeholder interviews. A professional interpreter was hired for events that were likely to draw Spanish-speaking stakeholders. Veronica Tam and Associates conducted an online survey to collect additional public input. The online survey was available in both English and Spanish. Print copies of the survey were available at community centers, libraries and civic buildings. The public events and online survey were promoted by the Collaborating Parties with bilingual flyers, e-blasts, website updates, social media posts and direct phone calls. Local news outlets also promoted the survey and public events.

This report summarizes the key findings from the public engagement process regarding housing barriers, housing discrimination and fair housing priorities for Monterey County.

---

II. Key Audiences and Outreach Tools

The public engagement program offered a wide range of opportunities for residents and stakeholders to share input to inform the AI development. The community outreach efforts were designed to collect feedback from community members representing a diversity of perspectives, interests and needs.

At the outset of the outreach planning, MIG developed a Community Participation Plan (CPP) which described the activities that the Collaborating Parties and consultant team would undertake to engage a diverse cross-section of the County and attract a wider audience to participate in the development of the AI. The CPP identified specific outreach approaches, methods, target audiences, key activities and a preliminary schedule for implementation.

A. Target Audiences

The Collaborating Parties sought to engage a broad range of community members and geographies across the County. In particular, the outreach program emphasized targeted engagement of “hard-to-reach” populations such as seniors, youth, people with disabilities, limited-English proficient communities, and low- and moderate-income residents. These “hard to reach” or traditionally under-represented groups are typically more vulnerable to housing discrimination. The key audiences targeted during the outreach process are outlined below.
This list is not intended to be exhaustive; instead it is a high-level review of select target audiences.

1. Monterey County Residents
   a. Low- to Moderate-Income Residents
   b. Limited-English Proficient Residents
   c. Seniors
   d. Youth
   e. Individuals with Disabilities
2. Monterey County Department Officials and Staff
   a. Economic Development Department
3. Municipal Agencies and Staff
4. Staff from the Cities of Monterey, Seaside and Salinas
5. City Council and Planning Commissioners
6. Housing Authority of the County of Monterey Staff and Leadership
7. Housing and Community Development Advisory Committees
8. Housing and Social Service Agencies
9. Service Providers Utilizing Entitlement Funds for Projects
10. Affordable Housing Developers
11. Affordable and Fair Housing Advocates and Organizations
12. Realtors
13. Tenant Organizations
14. Resident Advisory Boards
15. Public Housing Tenants
16. Housing Choice Voucher Recipients and Participating Landlords
17. Neighborhood Associations
18. Community Organizations
19. Farmworker Organizations
20. Faith-based Institutions and Leaders
21. Schools, Colleges and Other Educational Institutions
22. Businesses and Employees
23. Chambers of Commerce
24. Other Stakeholder Interest Groups

A list of all stakeholders and service providers contacted is included in Appendix A.

B. Outreach Tools
Key audiences were targeted through a variety of outreach and engagement methods and tools. The tools used to raise awareness for the AI process and to promote the public input
opportunities include:

- Stakeholder database (maintained throughout the outreach process);
- Bilingual flyers (Spanish and English);
- Bilingual e-blasts (Spanish and English);
- Websites of Collaborating Parties;
- Newsletters of Collaborating Parties;
- News media;
- Social media (Facebook, Twitter, NextDoor, etc.); and,
- Communications of civic and partner organizations.

Outreach efforts were designed to reach participants that are reflective of the demographics of the County including age, ethnicity, income and other characteristics. The partner forums, online survey, and community workshops were publicized broadly using a variety of communication methods.

The Project Team contacted approximately 142 organizations to promote the outreach activities. Appendix B presents a list of organizations that participated in one or more engagement activity. An overview of the community outreach tools utilized in conducting the public participation process is presented on the following page.
### Table 1. Public Outreach Tools

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outreach Tools</th>
<th>Target of Outreach</th>
<th>Corresponding Event(s)</th>
<th>Summary of Response/Attendance</th>
<th>URL (If applicable)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bilingual Flyers (Print and Digital)</strong></td>
<td>Broad outreach to Monterey County residents and stakeholders. Print flyers were distributed to high-traffic centers such as schools, libraries, community centers, local businesses and public buildings. Digital flyers were shared with agencies and organizations in the stakeholder database.</td>
<td>Partner Forums, Community Workshops, Online Survey</td>
<td>Digital flyers were emailed to the 142 targeted organizations and agencies in the stakeholder database. Print flyers were distributed at over 30 high-traffic community hubs to attract a broad audience.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bilingual E-Blasts</strong></td>
<td>Mass emails to stakeholders and community partners.</td>
<td>Partner Forums, Community Workshops, Online Survey</td>
<td>E-blasts sent to 142 stakeholders 2-3 times before each community workshop and partner forum.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Website Updates</strong></td>
<td>Broad outreach to Monterey County residents and stakeholders with computer and internet access.</td>
<td>Partner Forums, Community Workshops, Online Survey</td>
<td>The Cities of Salinas and Seaside posted information promoting the partner forums, community workshops and online survey to their websites.</td>
<td><a href="https://www.cityofsalinas.org/our-city-services/community-development/housing-and-community-development-division/assessment-fair-housing">https://www.cityofsalinas.org/our-city-services/community-development/housing-and-community-development-division/assessment-fair-housing</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Media</strong></td>
<td>Broad outreach to Monterey County residents and stakeholders with computer and internet access.</td>
<td>Community Workshops, Online Survey</td>
<td>Event information, flyers and survey links posted to social media including Facebook, Twitter and Next Door. The City of Seaside shared information regarding the online survey and Partner Forums on their Twitter and Facebook accounts.</td>
<td><a href="https://nextdoor.com/agency-post/ca/monterey/city-of-monterey/reminder-fair-housing-community-workshop-in-monterey-on-june-19-84724489/">https://nextdoor.com/agency-post/ca/monterey/city-of-monterey/reminder-fair-housing-community-workshop-in-monterey-on-june-19-84724489/</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Phone Calls</strong></td>
<td>Initial phone calls and follow-up calls to stakeholders and community partners.</td>
<td>Stakeholder Interviews, Partner Forums, Community Workshops, Online Survey</td>
<td>Phone calls made to specific contacts at the 142 organizations in the stakeholder database.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Personalized Emails</strong></td>
<td>Personal emails to stakeholders and community partners.</td>
<td>Stakeholder Interviews, Partner Forums, Community Workshops, Online Survey</td>
<td>Personal emails sent to 181 email addresses at the 142 stakeholder organizations and agencies. These email addresses were taken from the stakeholder database or the organizations’ websites. Some jurisdictions also sent emails to their databases to promote the online survey and community workshops.</td>
<td><a href="https://gonzalestribune.com/article/workshop-discusses-fair-housing-issues">https://gonzalestribune.com/article/workshop-discusses-fair-housing-issues</a> <a href="https://www.cityofsalinas.org/our-city-services/community-development/housing-and-community-development/news/regional-analysis-impediments-fair-housing-choice">https://www.cityofsalinas.org/our-city-services/community-development/housing-and-community-development/news/regional-analysis-impediments-fair-housing-choice</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>News Media</strong></td>
<td>Broad outreach to Monterey County residents.</td>
<td>Community Workshops, Online Survey</td>
<td>Article written in Gonzales Tribune regarding the Gonzales community workshop and promoting the online survey. Article written in the City Manager Newsletter for the City of Salinas, which goes out to all City employees and various partner organizations.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
III. Public Input Opportunities and Activities

A key priority for the public engagement was to make participation easy and accessible. Outreach activities included an online survey, stakeholder interviews, partner forums, and community workshops. Each of the activities are described in detail in the sections that follow. Table 5 summarizes the public input opportunities and activities on page 12.

A. Online Survey

Veronica Tam and Associates launched an online survey to collect input from residents and stakeholders on fair housing and discrimination in November 2017. The survey remained open for approximately seven months until June 2018, collecting a total of 463 responses. The online survey provided stakeholders who might not participate in a traditional workshop or intercept event with an opportunity to share their concerns, experiences and needs on their own time. The survey was promoted by the Collaborating Parties through bilingual flyers, mass emails, website updates, social media posts, and direct phone calls. The survey was also printed and distributed at community centers, libraries and civic buildings. The results of the online survey are available in Appendix C.

B. Stakeholder Interviews

Between February and March 2018, MIG conducted interviews with key housing and community stakeholders to gather their insights into housing barriers, housing discrimination and fair housing priorities across Monterey County. A list of the eight stakeholders interviewed is included below.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Stakeholder Name and Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central Coast Center for Independent Living</td>
<td>Elza Quezada, President</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Coalition of Homeless Services Providers</td>
<td>Katherine Thoeni, Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Human Services</td>
<td>Robin McCrae, Chief Executive Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Salinas Building Healthy Communities</td>
<td>Cesar Lara, Hub Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eden Council for Hope and Opportunity (ECHO)</td>
<td>Emily Garnica, Housing Counselor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MidPen Housing Corporation</td>
<td>Betsy Wilson, Director of Housing Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monterey Bay Economic Partnership</td>
<td>Matt Huerta, Housing Program Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veterans Transition Center</td>
<td>Bobby Merritt, Housing Manager</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

MIG, Inc. interviewed these eight individuals, asking each of them approximately nine questions. Responses were summarized only in aggregate, thereby encouraging the interviewees to speak freely. A full summary of the Stakeholder Interviews was completed in April 2018. This summary is available in Appendix D.
C. Partner Forums

The Collaborating Parties hosted two partner forums to collect input on fair housing needs and disparities of access. The target audiences for the partner forums included housing providers, advocacy organizations and public agencies. These forums were designed to solicit feedback from informed housing stakeholders and experts who specialize in housing-related issues. The partner forums were held in Seaside and Salinas respectively, and other meeting details are included in Table 2.

The Seaside Community Development Advisory Committee hosted the partner forum in Seaside on May 16, 2018. The City of Salinas hosted the partner forum on May 17, 2018. Approximately twenty individuals attended the partner forums. Partner forum participants included representatives from the Seaside Community Development Advisory Committee, ECHO Housing, Legal Services for Seniors, Seaside Homeless Committee, to name a few.

Table 3. Partner Forums

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Oldemeyer Center 989 Hilby Avenue</td>
<td>Wednesday, May 16, 2018</td>
<td>6:30 - 8:30 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seaside, CA 93955</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria J. Torres-Gil Community Center</td>
<td>Thursday, May 17, 2018</td>
<td>6:30 - 8:30 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>279 Calle Cabu Salinas, CA 93901</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

During the partner forums, presentations were delivered to provide a brief overview of fair housing to ground the audience in the core concepts, as well as a review of the AI purpose and development process. Representatives of ECHO Housing presented an overview of the fair housing services, resources and oversight that they provide in Monterey County. Following the presentations, participants were invited to share their thoughts and ideas on fair housing barriers and needs in small group discussions. The full list of discussion questions from the partner forums is available in Appendix E.

D. Community Workshops

Four community workshops were conducted by the Collaborating Parties to inform community members about fair housing issues, and to obtain input on housing needs, barriers and priorities. The dates, times and locations of each workshop is included in Table 3. Community workshops were publicized using bilingual flyers, e-blasts, social media, partner communications, websites of Collaborating Parties, direct emails and phone calls. Approximately 50 individuals attended the community workshops.
Table 4. Community Workshops

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Date and Time</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maria J. Torres-Gil Community Center</td>
<td>Thursday, May 24, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>279 Calle Cebu</td>
<td>6:30 - 8:30 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salinas, CA 93901</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monterey Public Library</td>
<td>Tuesday, June 19, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>625 Pacific Street</td>
<td>6:30 - 8:30 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monterey, CA 93940</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Castroville Branch Library</td>
<td>Wednesday, June 20, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11160 Speegle Street</td>
<td>6:00 - 8:00 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Castroville, CA 95012</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gonzales Branch Library</td>
<td>Saturday, June 23, 2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>851 5th Street</td>
<td>12:00 - 2:00 pm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gonzales, CA 93926</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The workshops were held at ADA accessible venues in locations close to public transit. Bilingual staff assisted with workshop facilitation in areas that were likely to attract Spanish speaking residents. The workshops were scheduled at varying times and days to accommodate the needs of residents and employees with different work schedules.

The interactive workshop format included brief presentations to describe fair housing and protected classes, as well as a description of the AI purpose and development process. ECHO Housing representatives presented an overview of the fair housing services and resources that they provide throughout the County. Next, workshop attendees participated in a large group discussion regarding fair housing barriers and issues facing protected classes in Monterey County. The full list of discussion questions from the community workshops is available in Appendix F.

The City of Salinas also independently facilitated a “Community Discussion on Housing” on March 29, 2018 at Sherwood Hall in Salinas, which aimed to educate tenants and landlords on fair housing issues. The workshop included presentations by staff from the City of Salinas and ECHO Housing, a panel discussion with four key housing agencies and housing advocates and a printed survey. The flyer and bilingual landlord and tenant surveys for this workshop are available in Appendix G.
### Table 5. Overview of Public Engagement Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Engagement Activity</th>
<th>Target of Outreach</th>
<th>Summary of Activity</th>
<th>Summary of Attendance/Responses</th>
<th>URL (If applicable)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stakeholder Interviews</strong></td>
<td>Key housing and community stakeholders.</td>
<td>In-depth conversations to gather insights into housing barriers, housing discrimination and fair housing priorities across Monterey County.</td>
<td>Eight stakeholder interviews between February and March 2018.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Partner Forums</strong></td>
<td>A wide range of stakeholders including: Neighborhood Associations, Community Organizations, Resident Advisory Boards, Public Housing Tenants, Faith-Based Leaders, Educational Institutions, Housing and Social Service Agencies, Service Providers Utilizing Entitlement Funds for Projects, City Council and Planning Commissioners, etc.</td>
<td>Informed and educated stakeholders on fair housing laws; collected input on fair housing needs and disparities of access; promoted other public engagement activities (e.g., community workshops and survey).</td>
<td>Two partner forums in May 2018 with a total of approximately 18 attendees (see table 3). Seaside Partner Forum, May 16th, 2018: Ten attendees representing the Community Development Advisory Committee, City of Salinas, the City of Seaside, Legal Services for Seniors, Seaside Homeless Committee, ECHO Housing and other organizations. Salinas Partner Forum, May 17th, 2018: Eight attendees representing various organizations including Central Coast Center for Independent Living, Housing Authority of Monterey County, City of Salinas, and the Maria Torres Gil Community Center.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Community Workshops</strong></td>
<td>Broad outreach to Monterey County residents and stakeholders.</td>
<td>Informed and educated residents on fair housing laws; collected input on fair housing needs and disparities of access; promoted other public engagement activities (e.g., community workshops and survey).</td>
<td>Four Community Workshops between May and June 2018 with a total of approximately 50 attendees (see table 4). The City of Salinas facilitated a “Community Discussion on Housing” on March 29, 2018.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Online Survey</strong></td>
<td>Broad outreach to Monterey County residents and stakeholders</td>
<td>Collected community input on their experiences with housing discrimination issues and concerns.</td>
<td>A total of 463 survey responses were submitted online.</td>
<td><a href="https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/Monterey_AI">https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/Monterey_AI</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
IV. Key Findings by Outreach Activity

A. Partner Forum Findings

The participant input and ideas shared during the Partner Forums are summarized below. The full list of discussion questions from the partner forums is available in Appendix E.

What are the most common barriers to housing in your community?

- **Affordability and Costs**: High costs of housing, lack of affordable housing, application fees, deposits and up-front costs.

- **Supply and Demand**: Short supply of affordable housing, water shortage and limits on new housing developments, lack of farmworker housing, shortage of pet-friendly units, lack of housing for students, long waitlists for housing units.

- **Mobility and Transit**: Affordable housing and jobs are not located in the same communities, long commutes, lack of public transportation options.

- **Income**: Low wages, people on fixed-incomes, Section 8 Vouchers.

- **Price-Setting**: Profit-driven sensibility of landlords and a heavy military presence, which drives the cost up in many communities.

- **Time Commitments**: Visiting required before purchasing or renting housing.

Can you describe your community’s experiences with housing discrimination?

- Increased racial/ethnic segregation throughout the County.

- Many people, such as immigrant farmworkers, living in substandard housing; “predatory habitability.”

- Illegal housing (e.g., converting garages).

- “Legal” discrimination in the form of price gouging.

- Retaliation by landlords (e.g., eviction, deferred maintenance).

If you received a fair housing complaint from your client or constituent, how would you handle it?

- Referrals to city staff and/or nonprofits that specialize in addressing housing discrimination.
  - **Cities**: Seaside, Salinas, Monterey.
  - **Local Agencies**: Housing Authority of the County of Monterey.
  - **Nonprofits**: NAACP, ECHO Housing, Coalition of Homeless Service Providers, Watsonville Legal Center, California Rural Legal Assistance.

- Advise constituent to keep records of discrimination and discriminatory practices.

- Contact the State Department of Fair Employment and Housing for mediation.

- Write a summary of complaints.

- Determine the facts by talking with both sides (i.e., landlord and tenants).
Call on behalf of client to inquire about rental units.

**What are the greatest challenges to your agency in meeting fair housing needs?**

- Shortage of subsidies and strategies to promote affordable, accessible housing for low, very low, and extremely low-income households, including protected classes.
- Ineffective/insufficient level of advertising to promote fair housing resources and services.
- Lack of funding and resources.
- Limited network of service providers.
- Residents with NIMBY mindsets.
- Insufficient staff capacity.
- Limited coordination on fair housing issues among local, regional and State fair housing enforcement agencies.
- Agencies lack sufficient awareness of potential fair housing impediments, and ways to address those impediments.
- Constituents fear retaliation from landlords and do not make formal complaints.
- Different housing challenges and needs between the Peninsula and South County.

Which protected classes have the greatest needs for improved service, and why?
Forum participants generally indicated that all protected classes are in great need of more fair housing support. However, the protected classes listed below were most frequently mentioned by participants as needing fair housing advocacy and resources:

- **Familial status** – Large families with children are frequently targeted by landlords for steering or denied units altogether.

- **Citizenship and immigration status** – Undocumented residents and workers are particularly fearful of retaliation by landlords due to the threat of deportation. Participants shared that landlords are also more likely to rent undocumented residents, farmworkers and Spanish-speakers sub-standard and illegal units.

- **Race** – People of color are frequently profiled based on their race and experience housing discrimination.

- **National origin** – Individuals are profiled based on their accents and country of origin.

- **Disabilities** – Participants reported incidents in which landlords refused to make reasonable modification and accommodations for individuals with varying disabilities or mental health issues.

- **Age** – Seniors were frequently mentioned as needing more fair housing support and advocacy, particularly because they are typically on fixed incomes and have difficulty finding affordable housing.

- **Religion** – Muslims were highlighted as a religious group that experiences discrimination in the County.

- **Source of Income** – Landlords sometimes perceive low-income tenants in the service sector or agricultural industry as risky tenants. Participants reported incidents in which landlords increased security deposits for low-income tenants. Some landlords choose not to accept Section 8 recipients partly because they see Section 8 as a temporary and unreliable source of income.

What are the greatest misconceptions or misunderstandings about housing barriers that you hear in your service area?

- Perception that housing is affordable and available for all who want to live in Monterey County.

- Perception that “illegal” immigrants do not have rights because they do not have citizenship.

- Misperceptions about demographic shifts in Monterey County.

- Perception that housing issues are easy problems to fix.

- Perception that discrimination does not exist in the Peninsula.
What do you find to be the greatest challenges to building community awareness about fair housing in your communities?

- Lack of funding for staff capacity and resources.
- Lack of community social network to disseminate information.
- Insufficient coordination between public agencies and service providers; lack of network between service providers.
- Inability to identify those in greatest need.
- Some communities generally oppose change to zoning and development standards.
- Fear of retaliation; undocumented immigrants and workers are particularly fearful to speak up.

What community assets exist today that could be better used in addressing fair housing?

- Existing communication networks for sharing information including social media and local television.
- A grassroots education campaign to engage and educate residents and stakeholders.
- Community events, such as fairs.
- Traditional marketing tools such as billboards and postcards.
- Partner collaboration and resource leveraging of housing and social service providers.

B. Community Workshop Findings

The key findings from the four community workshops are summarized by discussion question below. Workshop-specific findings are designated by geography. The full list of discussion questions from the community workshops is available in Appendix F.
What are the most common barriers to housing in your community?

- Housing is not affordable to many residents.
- The demand for affordable housing far exceeds the supply.
- Inadequate supply of affordable housing available to lower-income households.
- Community resistance to development of multi-family rental housing and housing for lower-income households.
- The housing stock in Monterey County is old which creates habitability issues.
- Age of housing stock limits accessible housing for people with disabilities.
- New construction of housing is limited by water scarcity.
- Long waitlists for housing units.
- Increased costs of living (e.g., utilities) in Monterey County.
- There are new types of homelessness; many of today’s homeless people have full-time jobs or even multiple jobs but still cannot afford housing in Monterey County.
- Overcrowding is increasingly an issue as families and households become unable to afford the high cost of rent. Severe overcrowding impacts families’ safety and child welfare.
- Seniors need more help and services than they are currently receiving.
  - There are certain issues that are more prevalent among seniors, such as hoarding.
- Fixed incomes limit the ability of seniors to meet rent increases or respond to housing market changes.

Salinas Community Workshop, May 24th, 2018
Castroville
- The distribution of affordable housing does not reflect local needs; affordable housing is not located near job centers.
  - The hospitality industry is primarily located in the City of Monterey. However, the industry does not pay enough for workers to live nearby.
- The lack of efficient, regional public transportation exacerbates the affordable housing crisis. Low-income workers who do not own cars spend hours commuting on public transportation.
- Landlords often reject tenants who receive vouchers or rental subsidies.
- Housing is not being built in the Peninsula.
- Mobile homes, RV's and campers are increasingly common. In Castroville, RV's and campers are clogging public streets and creating public health issues from dumping garbage and raw sewage in public spaces.

Gonzales
- Farmworker housing is scarce.
- Housing resources are concentrated in Salinas. South County needs improved access to housing services and resources. For example, most homeless shelters operate in Salinas; homeless individuals and families from South County cannot afford to travel to Salinas to visit these shelters.
- There is an epidemic of people living in garages, shacks and sheds that are uninhabitable.
- Many landlords refuse to rent rooms to families. As a result, families have a difficult time finding rooms for rent. This is impacted by whether the owner lives on-site or off-site.
- Agricultural workers are segregated from the rest of the population. The City of Greenfield is similarly segregated.

Monterey
- New housing is skewed towards high-end developments for wealthier residents.
- In-migration of high-income residents (i.e., “invasion of Silicon Valley”) greatly impacts housing affordability.
- The military increases demand for housing and drives ups costs because of the salaries of military employees.

Salinas
- People with a criminal background struggle to find housing.
- Individuals with domestic pets are limited in their available housing options.
- Waitlists for vouchers are extremely long.
- It is difficult to find landlords who will accept housing vouchers.
Can you describe your community's experiences with housing discrimination or challenges finding housing?

- Landlords sometimes charge families more for utilities upon learning the number of children.
- Some landlords take advantage of undocumented and Spanish speaking tenants; landlords are raising rents on these tenants who live in fear of retaliation.
- Landlords rarely translate paperwork, despite being required to by law.
- HUD Fair Market Rents do not reflect current market rates.

Castroville

- Castroville participants had not experienced discrimination personally, however three participants work with clients who regularly report incidents of discrimination. One participant reported that her clients experience discrimination because of their sources of income, particularly when those sources include vouchers and/or subsidies.
- Clients do not report housing discrimination for many reasons, including being unaware that discrimination has occurred and fear of retaliation.
- Landlords sometimes increase security deposits (up to a 100% increase) for low-income tenants, who are viewed as high-risk tenants.

If you believe you have been discriminated against, have you reported the incident?

- Individuals who experience housing discrimination rarely report incidents due to fear of retaliation and/or a lack of faith in the reporting processes.
- Of the fifty workshop participants who experienced housing discrimination, only four reported incidents of discrimination. These individuals were discriminated against for familial status or race. The three participants each reported the incidents to different agencies, including the Department of Fair Employment and Housing, the Utilities Commission, and ECHO Housing.

Which protected classes have the greatest needs for improved service, and why?

- In general, workshop participants indicated that all protected classes are in great need of more fair housing support. However, the protected classes listed below were most frequently mentioned by participants as needing fair housing advocacy and resources:
  - Familial status
  - Mental and physical disability
  - National origin
  - Age
  - Source of income
What do you find to be the greatest challenges to building community awareness about fair housing in your community?

- Tenants lack knowledge of housing rights and fair housing resources.
- Some people who experience housing discrimination do not recognize that they are being discriminated against.
- Landlords are often unaware of the illegality of their actions; landlords sometimes discriminate against tenants without realizing it.

**Castroville**
- There is some confusion around the legality of security deposits for both landlords and tenants.
- There is confusion over the rights of individuals to have service animals in units that forbid domestic pets. There is also confusion over the difference between domestic pets and service animals.

**Monterey**
- There is a misconception in the City of Monterey that poverty is not an issue.

**Salinas**
- There is a misconception that immigrants do not have fair housing rights.

---

Monterey Community Workshop, June 19th, 2018.

Monterey County Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice
Public Participation Summary - FINAL
What community assets exist today that could be better used in addressing fair housing?

**Castroville**
- Schools are a focal point of the community in Castroville. They function as activity and information centers for families. Parents are highly involved in their children’s education and extracurricular activities.
- United Way

**Gonzales**
- The City of Gonzales has kiosks with flyers at the library, City Hall and the Medical Center.
- The City of Soledad includes public information on utility bills. This approach can be replicated to promote fair housing information on utility bills.
- Radio announcements
- Television commercials

**Monterey**
- ECHO Housing

Gonzales Community Workshop, June 23rd, 2018.
Salinas
- Movie theater commercials/trailers
- Flyers by mail
- Committees and associations
- Churches
- Radio announcements
- Television ads

V. Next Steps
The Collaborating Parties will incorporate the input and findings from the public participation activities into the development of the Analysis of Impediments to Fair Housing Choice (AI). The draft AI will be available for public review in Spring 2019.