

**BIG SUR MULTI-AGENCY ADVISORY COUNCIL
MEETING MINUTES FOR JUNE 28, 2019
BIG SUR GRANGE
HIGHWAY 1, BIG SUR, CALIFORNIA 93920**

I. CALL TO ORDER

Supervisor Adams called the meeting to order at approximately 10:07 am.

II. ROLL CALL AND INTRODUCTIONS

Roll call and introductions were made. BSMAAC members in attendance included Martha Karstens (Resident of Big Sur – North Coast), Anneliese Agren (Resident of Big Sur – South Coast), Kirk Gafill (Big Sur Chamber of Commerce), Butch Kronlund (Coast Property Owners Association – now Big Sur Community Association), Joseph Sidor (Monterey County Resource Management Agency), Supervisor Mary Adams (Monterey County, District 5), Jake Sanderson (Monterey Peninsula Regional Park District), Michael Watson (California Coastal Commission), Sara von Schwind (Caltrans), Brent Marshall (California State Parks), Fin Eifert (USFS), Robert Rivas (California Assembly, District 30), Katharine Moon (US Congress, District 20).

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

The March 15, 2019 minutes were approved as presented.

IV. PUBLIC COMMENT ON NON-AGENDA ITEMS:

- **Steve Beck** – Appreciates the new paving between Bixby Bridge and Hurricane Point, however, it does not include any additional pavement for bicycles. It is an issue with Caltrans; the Big Sur Land Use Plan and Coast Highway Management Plan call for room for bicycles, but under a maintenance project it is not included. Find a way to add space for bikes when doing repaving.
- **Laura Lawrence** – Thanks to the community and Supervisor Adams for supporting Blaze Engineering project at the Board of Supervisors.
- **Lindsay Romano** – Threat of campfires in the National Forest. Comment addressed to the USFS – it would be great to eliminate the threat by disassociating campfires from camping. They are not needed anymore, there is no justification for them. Post signage that campfires are not permitted, that there will be fines and that they will be strictly enforced.
- **Gerry Malais, County OES** – Informing everyone of the PG&E Program to shut down the electrical system when there is the threat of a wildfire. County is working on the response time. Big Sur has only one transmission main.

V. NEW BUSINESS:

a) Big Sur Byways Committee Formation

- **Supervisor Adams** clarified that Caltrans is not the lead on this agenda item. It is also not a County run committee, but she took first step needed to get it going by asking the Board of Supervisors to pass a resolution on April 30, 2019 to initiate formation of this committee. This committee was identified back in 2004 as the group that would oversee

implementation of Caltrans' Coast Highway Management Plan. In the last fifteen years, no agency had been willing to step up to support this committee, but at this time, the MCCVB has agreed to provide administrative support. The Big Sur Byway Organization is meant to represent and interpret the Big Sur Coast Highway Management Plan while concurrently providing an opportunity for all stakeholders to be heard and have meaningful input in a public forum. The Organization should meet publicly at least once every six months.

Members will consist of:

- 5 Resident Representatives (1 each from: Big Sur Highlands; Mid Coast; Big Sur Proper; South Coast; 1 at large)
 - 1 Business Representative (1 from the Big Sur Chamber of Commerce)
 - 3 Public Agency Representatives (1 each from: U.S. Forest Service; California Department of Parks and Recreation; California Department of Transportation)
 - **Supervisor Adams** shared that she put out a call for statements of interest for the resident representatives. Five statements had been received to date, one for each of the seats. She stated that she would continue to accept statements of interest until July 12th via e-mail to her office. She shared that the Chamber has appointed Rick Aldinger to their seat. The agencies are still determining who will be their representatives. She noted that once members have been appointed, that group will need to convene an initial meeting and make some decisions about how to move forward with a plan for public meetings. She encouraged the first step to be for the committee to learn or refresh their memories about what the CHMP is.
 - **Kirk Gaffill** thanked Supervisor Adams and Caltrans for getting this going after 15 years, and thanked the MCCVB for their role in it.
 - **Sara von Schwind** responded to a question about the committee's relationship to the BSMAAC, stating that coordination between BSMAAC and the Byway Committee will need to have further discussion about how that will work.
- b) State Parks Old Naval Facility Tours – California State Parks
- **Brent Marshall** shared about the recent meeting about the proposed tours, noting that the current proposal does not include development. There is a 2004 General Plan and a 2011 amendment, and things such as fencing, signage, and parking would need to be done in line with the General Plan. He stated the meeting provided a more accurate description of what will be taking place, dispelling rumors, and there were good ideas shared at the meeting.
 - **Mike Watson** asked about the work Point Sur and when it would re-open for tours. Brent responded that the bridge work will be done in a year, hopefully closer to 6-8 months.
 - **Peggy Goodale** asked whether this would be a pilot or permanent program, and whether it will have more impact as an attraction. Brent responded that this is a pilot to inform how it works, then will come back to the community for a long term plan or future proposals.
 - **Steve Beck** commented he thought it was a bad idea that would encourage traffic in the Critical Viewshed. Steve stated that he doesn't agree with the role of the area as historically significant and that he would prefer to see the area restored to native habitat.

- **Mary Trotter** noted that this is one of thirty areas used as a spy station, and that 27 of them have been taken down, and commented that she does not think the tours are a good idea.
 - **Barbara Woyt** stated that this is in conflict with the critical viewshed and natural resources, and that any plans or funds should go to restoring the buildings on top of the rock, build on existing programs, and to consider the CCC period more significant for interpretation. The naval facility shouldn't become a new attraction. Views traveling the highway should enhance the rock; the buildings should be removed.
 - **Rob Carver**, former board member and past president of Central Coast Lighthouse Keepers, suggested that State Parks could produce a virtual tour of the facility for \$40K - \$50K.
- c) Adler Ranch - Esselen Tribe of Monterey County
- **Tom Little Bear Nason**, Esselen Tribal Representative, presented their proposal for acquiring the Adler Ranch property. Their goal is for the property to be used for tribal ceremonies and repatriation of ancestors (i.e., location for re-burials). They would work towards creating an emergency access/refuge area with fire breaks in the case of wildfires. They would plan to have docent led tours, but not for the property to be open to the public.
 - **Peter Colby** stated that Western Rivers Conservancy has been working with Mr. Nason and coordinating with CPOA and the Fire Safe Council on this project.
 - **Butch Kronlund** asked about maintenance of the Mescal Ridge fire break.
 - **Pam Silkwood** asked where they are with a purchase agreement and whether there would be a deed restriction. Mr. Nason responded and stated that maintenance of the fire break would be allowed and written into the deed.
 - **Mr. Nason** stated they are working with Don Gruber from the Conservancy of the Range of the Condor on the purchase.
 - **Don Gruber** expressed the Conservancy of the Range of the Condors support for the tribe's acquisition of the property and stated that they had formed as a land trust.

VI. OLD BUSINESS:

- a) Caltrans Big Sur Transportation Demand Management Plan – Caltrans
- Caltrans representative **John Olejnik** provided an update regarding the Transportation Demand Management Plan (TDMP) that they are preparing for the Big Sur coast from Carmel to Cambria. He stated that a goal of the TDMP would be to identify alternatives for visitors and others to driving on Hwy 1, and to develop strategies to support those alternatives. Examples could include Shuttles, timing of trips, and sustainability measures such as electric vehicle charging stations. Mr. Olejnik introduced **Stephanie Briggs** from the firm Design Workshop, who is supporting Caltrans with this project. They thanked everyone who participated in the meetings they had held that week and offered to talk further with people after the meeting. More information can be found at “sustainablehighway1.com”
 - **Annalisa Agren** asked about the purpose of the plan, noting that at the Cambria meeting residents were asked if they could modify their travel times to avoid peak. She noted that residents have

already changed their drive times to accommodate visitor peak midday traffic. She noted that John mentioned at the Cambria meeting of a 20-30 year tourism peak and that the plan needs to address that. She then stated that SB1, the gas tax increase for road projects, and Visit CA's road trip campaign are at odds with the California's AB-32 and SB-375 goals for greenhouse gas emissions, thus Visit CA's road trip campaign, though clearly an economic driver and benefactor for gas tax and road improvements, is not sustainable in these times of climate change. The plan must address greenhouse gas emissions and work on public transport, shuttles, etc.

- **Mr. Olenik** responded that the Coastal Commission is a stakeholder in the plan and there are lots of parallel efforts at this time, for example plans for the State Parks at the northern section at Point Lobos. He acknowledged the need to plan ahead for projected levels of tourism and see what can stick and who will be the likely implementing agencies.
- **Butch Kronlund** thanked Caltrans for gathering information regarding traffic volumes on Sycamore Canyon Road.
- **Pam Silkwood** asked if the plan would address the Coastal Trail alignment and was it creating a second process. John Olejnik responded that it would only be incorporated by reference and will simply incorporate what comes out of the current community effort.
- **Martha Diehl** commented that the community and Caltrans need baseline data/information and actual traffic counts in order to evaluate and quantify the results of different proposals. She believes that data collection needs to be more robust and asked if Caltrans could make the information more accessible. She suggested the data collection should be ongoing and that the most useful way to move forward would be to define, test, and evaluate pilot programs. She asked Caltrans to make note of any data that is estimated rather than measured, and expressed concern about generalizations made from it and that conjectures are made from real data. She gave the example that the post card survey was not comprehensive.
- **Heather Chappellet** commented on the need to have cameras at Sycamore Canyon over fourth of July weekend and over an extended period of time to capture the flashpoints and asked if the cameras could be left in place for a year. She noted that it is not the spike that is interesting, but how people are using those areas, during peak times.
- **Mr. Olenik** responded that the cameras are battery operated and that is why they are temporary. He also noted that he had heard Martha's comments and is going to go back and investigate how to do better data collection over time. He noted the limitations due to lack of cell service in the area, and that there are tools and opportunities that will need to be a longer term effort.
- **Rob Carver** asked about the currency of the data, and Mr. Olenik responded that the existing data is 2016 annual average daily traffic.
- **Steve Beck** encouraged everyone to pay attention to this, and that it is addressing things they have been asking for a long time. He commented that real-time information is necessary but depends on cell phone access. He likes the idea of being able to give travelers real time information.
- **Barbara Woyt** asked about the assumptions used by Caltrans regarding the 20 to 30 year tourism peak and asked if the assumptions would accommodate the peak. She stated that traffic levels are compromising the goals of the LUP and whether there is a way to draw a line. She asked Coastal Commission staff if they have created an app for the traveling public, how does that work with what Caltrans is trying to do.

- **Mike Watson** from the Coastal Commission responded that the app is available to the public, it includes Big Sur and has info on what infrastructure is available, but it is not a real time application.
 - **John Handy** commented that influencing public behavior is only part of the solution, but that there are structural ways to also mitigate problems. Another part of the solution involves upgrading the infrastructure of Hwy 1 (e.g.; bike lanes, restrooms, trash cans, etc.).
 - **Lindsey Romano** commented that the solution is to get control of Hwy1 and asked if they would consider establishing a toll road or a reservation system.
 - **Mr. Olenik** responded that there are no laws that would allow a toll road at this point, because there is no free option available and an equitable option must be provided. He noted that mother nature could close the highway. He stated that Muir Woods is an example of a destination reservation system that might be a strategy.
 - **Supervisor Adams** commented on having a better plan for outreach to visitors, educating and providing information, and that she is looking to the Convention and Visitors Bureau (CVB) to help with what can be done before people visit. She stated that working on better cell phone coverage would be a goal for her.
- b) Cell Phone Coverage Issues – Congressman Panetta’s Office
- **Katherine Moon** provided a status update, stating that they have held several meetings to figure out what is the project that can be pursued. There has been no application made yet because AT&T will need to make a business case for it.
 - **Onal Kucuk** asked about the scope and what is the true constraint.
 - **Butch Kronlund** commented on the cost of infrastructure options, with a cost range from \$3-5M to \$20M. There is fiber only to Yankee Point, and it would need to be run on poles to Bixby. There is an option of two monopoles and five small cell antennas that would be needed. Viewshed issues and related things would need to be worked through RMA, LUAC and CCC. There are no longer roaming charges, leaving AT&T with no financial incentive to do it, but could be done with Verizon. He noted the need to pressure elected officials on the health and safety issues, and to pursue opportunities for grants.
 - **David Smiley** commented that Bixby was quite a way north and that it will need to go further. Coverage will get better from Point Sur to Post Ranch once the 5G goes online.
 - **Yuri Anderson** commented about the mandate to underground new infrastructure, and the need to convince CPUC to allow aerial fiber on existing poles.
 - **Eduardo Isner** asked about the old Pacific Bell and AT&T conduits in the ground.
 - **Mike Caplin** responded they are not existing.
 - **Martha Karstens** suggested considering signs for points south of where cell service is available.
 - **Kirk Gafill** suggested inviting AT&T to make a presentation to the BSMAAC, and stated that new possibilities are emerging for the Big Sur Valley area.
 - **Lindsay Romano** commented about the option to use Iridium satellite networks.
- c) Brief status updates on ongoing issues, if any (1-2 minutes)
- i) CHP Housing – CHP and California State Parks
- **Brent Marshall** and CHP rep commented that the housing project is in review with the Fire Marshall’s office. **Kirk Gafill** requested an update at the next meeting from the

State elected officials' offices, stressing the importance of law enforcement to the community.

- ii) Garrapata State Park Restrooms - California State Parks
 - Brent Marshall commented that surveyors recently evaluated 2 possible sites for locating the restrooms at the Soberanes Creek barn area or Garrapata Beach, on the west side outside of the viewshed where it could be seen but not obstruct the viewshed. That would reduce the crossing of the highway. They will have more on the final design in approximately 90 days, and they will have to have public input.
- iii) Julia Pfeiffer Burns restroom replacement - California State Parks
 - Brent Marshall announced that this project is finished.
- iv) Log Jam on Big Sur River – California State Parks
 - **Brent Marshall** commented that he did not have an update.
 - **Sara von Schwind** commented that it is impacting the highway and will need to be addressed, and that Caltrans would work with State Parks on it.
 - **Martha Karstens** commented that there may be two areas that they should check to see if they are problems. The second area is just north of post mile 47.3.
- v) Wayland Bridge Replacement
 - **Brent Marshall** commented that they are working on getting the contractor back, after resolving a contract issue.
- vi) Parking at the Big Sur Deli
 - **Martha Karstens** announced that the situation appears to be much improved, but that it continues to be an ongoing discussion. She asked if there was a permit requirement for attendants.
 -

VII. REPORTS FROM MEMBER AGENCIES:

- a. **Annalisa Agren, South Coast Big Sur Resident**, asked that if there was anyone with a hankering to take over as the representative, to contact Supervisor Adams office. She asked if County OES could maximize alerts to include e-mails, as is done by Santa Clara County. Gerry Malais responded by stating that anyone can sign up for multiple ways to receive alerts; either by text, phone, or email. She noted the work by State Parks work at Piedras Blancas in San Luis Obispo to put in more bathroom, she encouraged the USFS to resurrect a visitor center at Salmon Creek. She asked about how to make a customer service request to change a sign. Sara Von Schwinn responded that it would need to be compliant with the Uniform Vehicle Code, and that a language change is difficult. Ms. Agren expressed concern about campfires and there being no clearance and no patrols. She thanked District 5 and USFS for road vegetation maintenance.

- b. **Martha Karstens, North Coast Big Sur Resident**, asked folks to help clean up the Grange after the meeting and announced upcoming Grange Hall events. She noted the activities of the CERT, now with CERV and 501c(3), so it is possible to make donations. They have a new website. She noted activities of the Historic Society, with the museum now open and that a recent event had 60 people. Asked if the criteria that outdoor grows could be on the existing/previous growers could be confirmed. Supervisor Adams responded that was correct. She asked about a passing zone at Bixby that now appears to be a double yellow. **Sara Von Schwinn** responded that it may be a safety issue. She asked when Andrew Molera State Park would re-open for camping. **Brent Marshall** responded not this year and there is no ETA. Lastly, Martha commented about new homeowners insurance requirements for 24 foot wide access roads, and that fire insurance would likely be a crisis across the state. **Senator Monnings'** office responded that they were aware of that issue and hopefully will report back at the next meeting.
- c. **Kirk Gafill, Big Sur Chamber of Commerce**, thanked State Parks, CHP, and Sheriff's Office for working together and having such dedicated rangers and officers who responded to the recent shooting incident. Provided a business update, including that traffic levels this year have been comparable to 2018, but that they were 10 to 15% below 2015/16 levels, based on guest counts.
- d. **Butch Kronlund, Community Association of Big Sur**, wants to continue the discussion they had at their annual meeting on visitation. He invited people to attend their August 5th meeting on destination stewardship, when expert Costas Christ will come to speak on this topic. Thanked Supervisor Adams and the Convention and Visitors Bureau for the funding that has been allocated to Big Sur to address these issues. **Rick Aldinger**, River Inn, recognized the Coast Property Owners Association's past role in the community and the transition to the new name of Community Association of Big Sur. He asked that they continue to support the Land Use Plan as they embark on new initiatives, and to include the correct stakeholders in their process and conversation.
- e. **Joe Sidor, Monterey County Resource Management Agency** – Informed the public about the availability of project status reports, and that the Big Sur LUAC received a presentation about the Pfeiffer Beach shuttle program at its meeting on Tuesday, June 25th.
- f. **Supervisor Mary Adams, Monterey County** – Shared that the Board of Supervisors has just approved the County budget for next year. \$150,000 was identified as funding to the MCCVB specifically to address tourism impacts in Big Sur. She noted the Board recently passed a resolution regarding invasive species. She announced that the draft short-term rental ordinance would be considered by the Planning Commission on July 24th. She also commented that the outdoor grow pilot program is allowed for previously operating legal medical grows only. She noted that she has not gotten any recent updates from the Coastal Commission about the status of resolving the concerns that she and others have raised about Ventana Inn. She has been working with the Coastal Commission to return jurisdiction over Ventana Inn to the County and hoped to get an update from Coastal staff. She noted that she continues to support efforts to deal with parking and traffic problems and the proposals for shuttles, but she is concerned they might take some time to be ongoing. She noted that the different efforts with the Byway committee, the Caltrans TDM plan, and the shuttle proposals will need to find a way to weave themselves together so that we can start to really deal with these issues. **Mike Caplan** thanked Supervisor Adams for the referral to the RMA regarding defensible space and asked if the BSMAAC could establish an ongoing agenda item to provide updates on addressing laws that interfere with a property owner's ability to prepare for wildfires. He

commented that the RMA acknowledged the conflicts between regulations. He also asked if the Governor or the Board of Supervisors could issue a local emergency declaration and suspend environmental laws that get in the way of doing the work.

Martha Karstens asked if there is a specific list yet for outdoor grows.

David Smiley asked for an update regarding the Big Sur Land Use Plan. Sarah Hardgrave responded that County RMA staff had informed the Supervisors office that they are working on it and will provide the LUAC with the County's draft before submitting to the Coastal Commission.

Pam Silkwood asked about Ventana Inn, and Mike Watson responded. Butch Kronlund specifically asked about Cadillac Flats, and Mike Watson commented that the public would likely be pleased with the Coastal Commission's decision.

- g. **Jake Sanderson, Monterey Peninsula Regional Park District**, announced the extension of the public comment period for the Palo Corona environmental document to July 29th, and that it is available on their website. The GDP will be updated based on the CEQA review. He commented that Phase 1 of the General Development Plan to improve the Rancho Canada Unit would be completed within two years, and that other areas would be opened/improved pending funding. He noted there are three CalFire projects on MPRPD property and they have been working on agreements with CalFire to do them. He announced that the MPRPD Board would be holding a special meeting on June 29th to review their Strategic Plan and update it for 2020 – 2024. He stated they are looking forward to opening more areas of Palo Corona Regional Park, including the Whisler-Wilson unit near San Jose Creek, and that they're developing a restoration plan for the former golf course.
- h. **Mike Watson, Coastal Commission**, noted that the Highway 1 paving and maintenance project would likely be going to the Commission in July. He announced that the City of Pacific Grove Local Coastal Program certification is also moving forward at the July meeting. The Commission will also be holding a workshop with coastal cities and counties on July 12th with a focus on sea level rise, short-term rentals and LCP update issues. Pam Silkwood asked about inclusion of funding for the Coastal Trail in Caltrans projects, and Mike responded that the project only funds maintenance of the highway. Dana Carnazzo asked whether it includes paving of the Bixby Canyon entrance on Coast Road.
- i. **Sara von Schwind, Caltrans**, informed the public about the availability of the Caltrans project list, which identifies both current and future projects. She specifically noted an emergency project near Ragged Point in San Luis Obispo County, which would result in Hwy 1 night closures from 9pm – 5am and is tentatively planned for mid-August.
Martha Diehl asked if extra law enforcement could be available over the holiday weekend. She asked about funding for law enforcement during filming and if it could be used during special events.
Anneliese Agren commented that this should be added to the TAMC cone zone report, even if in San Luis Obispo County.
Dana Carnazzo commented that the cones at the entrance to Coast Road near Bixby Bridge do make a difference, and asked if the County could narrow the entrance permanently.
- j. **Brent Marshall, State Parks**, thanked the community for their support over the recent critical incident that had happened the day before, providing an explanation of the incident, stating that it had been a heroic effort, and asking people not to conjecture about what happened and to respect the privacy of the individuals involved during the follow up investigation. He commented that the State Parks Commission consideration of the General Plan for the Carmel Area State Parks has been postponed until October. He noted that they are working with Park It

on the shuttle options and that it and the San Jose Creek trail project would continue move forward in the meantime. He noted there is more discussion to be had about the naval facility and that he would follow up on Andrew Molera and the log jam.

- k. **MBNMS, Karen Grimmer** was unable to attend the meeting. No report.
- l. **Fin Eifert, U.S. Forest Service**, noted that he is the acting District Ranger until Tim Short returns in October. He commented that fire break work is ongoing, including roadside mastication, and there will be collaboration on the Forest Health grant application. He announced that a planning effort is underway to re-open the Pine Ridge Trail, and that he recently met with State Parks and Ventana Wilderness Alliance about to do a scoping analysis of what will be needed. He said that they are looking into whether there is any recourse for the contractor work on Sycamore Canyon Road. He shared that the USFS had submitted a document to the FAA regarding maintenance on Coast Ridge Road, as they share in the responsibility. He noted the forest health invasive plant treatment proposal public comment period had closed and that use of an herbicide would only be done with hand treatment. He noted the NEPA process is being updated and that it is also open for public comment. **Martha Karstens** asked about campfires and if it could be an agenda item.
- m. **Assemblyman Robert Rivas** commented on the passage of the State's budget the night before, noting that it makes commitments to housing, emergency preparedness including funding for forest health, fire fighting technologies. How some of the funding will be distributed is not yet known. He noted that he has been working on bills for farmworker housing, teacher grants, and oil spill response. He encouraged collaboration at the local level for parks and recreation and getting projects shove ready.
- n. **Toby (Tobias) Uptain-Villa, Office of Senator Bill Monning**, noted the passage of the Safe and Affordable Drinking Water Act, which will provide \$130M for communities that do not have access. He also noted that they had secured \$17M for the interlake tunnel project. They are collaborating on the Big Sur cell service issue. He gave thanks to Mike Caplin for his work on the California Coastal Trail and to State Parks for their incident response this week.
- o. **Katharine Moon, Office of Congressman Jimmy Panetta**, stated that the Congressman regretted that he could not be there, but that he was holding a meeting with the Secretary of Agriculture that day. He hopes to have discussion about the funding shortages for the USFS. The list of items in the omnibus included \$29M for the central coast.

VIII. REPORTS FROM OTHER AGENCIES ON ISSUES PERTINENT TO BIG SUR

None.

IX. NEXT MEETING

Supervisor Adams announced that the next meeting will be held on August 23, 2019 at 10am at the Big Sur Lodge.

X. ADJOURNMENT

Supervisor Adams adjourned the meeting at 1:13 pm.